



## OVERVIEW

### BIG IDEA

Is basic health care a right, privilege, or responsibility?

### OBJECTIVE

**11.2:** Evaluate arguments to determine whether basic health care is a right, privilege, or responsibility

### AGENDA

1. Right? Privilege? Responsibility?
2. Differing Positions
3. Sources of Health Care Payments
4. Debate Prep
5. Debate

### HOMEWORK

Evaluate Jose's case and make defensible arguments for healthcare as a right, privilege, and responsibility.

# LESSON 11.2

## Right, Privilege, Responsibility...?

### SUMMARY:

This lesson will challenge students to evaluate their own beliefs about healthcare and health policy by posing the question: Is healthcare a right, privilege, or responsibility? First, students will jot down an initial take on the question. Then they will review some general definitions of each of these positions and try to assign them to three different viewpoints. Next they will evaluate data showing where health payments come from. Finally, they will be assigned a viewpoint to defend in a scenarios-based multifaceted debate which will give the whole class a chance to participate.

### STANDARDS:


**NHES 4.12.1:** Use skills for communicating effectively with family, peers, and others to enhance health.




MODULE 11: HEALTH POLICY LESSON 11.2

## Healthcare: Right vs. Responsibility

Obj. 11.2: Evaluate arguments to determine whether basic health care is a right, privilege, or responsibility

 **Right? Privilege? Responsibility? OH MY!**

Is basic health care a right, privilege or responsibility? Write your response to the focus question. Include at least **two** reasons to support your opinion.

 **Differing Positions**

Politicians and U.S. citizens fall into three categories in their opinions for health care. Some believe that health care is a right and therefore, "something that is due to a person by a governmental body, law, tradition, or nature." Others believe that health care is a privilege and therefore, "a special benefit, exemption from a duty, or immunity from penalty, given to a particular person, a group or a class of people." Finally, many believe that health care is a responsibility, "a particular burden of obligation upon one; being accountable, as for something within one's power, control, or management."

Use the definitions above to determine with a partner which stance each of the following arguments make regarding health care in Bethany's situation. Identify which argument below represents the belief that health care is a **right**, a **privilege**, or a **responsibility**. Include **specific** evidence from the argument to support your statement.

*Bethany, a 34 year-old bank teller, fails to change her diet after several recommendations from her doctor. Over several years, she becomes morbidly obese. Now she would like to receive gastric bypass surgery to help her lose weight.*

**Citizen 1:** Bethany has paid taxes and social security since she began college. She is also a full-time employee at a big banking company, so her employer's health insurance plan should cover most of the expenses of the surgery. One of the major benefits to her job is health care coverage, so she should not be denied.  
\_\_\_\_\_ Explain:

**Citizen 2:** Morbid obesity can have drastic effects on a person's long-term health. Bethany, like all other US citizens, deserves to be taken care of by society, regardless of her job, socioeconomic status, or other characteristics. Medical care is a social service that no one should be denied.  
\_\_\_\_\_ Explain:

**Citizen 3:** Unfortunately, Bethany had a lot of other options to prevent and treat this condition before it came to the point of asking for gastric bypass surgery. If she truly believes this is the best option, she should be entitled to elect it, if she can pay for it. However, our health choices often shape the outcomes we face, so she needed to take control sooner in order to avoid this. Society can't be expected to pay for it now.  
\_\_\_\_\_ Explain:

**DO NOW:**

This is a great place for a Think-Pair-Share, so that students have a chance to bounce ideas off others at the beginning of class.

**THINK:**

1. Privilege
2. Right
3. Responsibility



**Sources of Health Care Payments**

The health care services in America have not only been labeled as the best, but also the most expensive. Under the U.S. system, the actual cost of the service is usually not known until after the service has been provided, unless the consumer is bold and savvy enough to inquire ahead of time. Most are not. Payments for the U.S. health care bill come from four sources as seen in the pie chart below.

Source of Payment	Percentage
Private health insurance	36.1%
Federal Government	33.9%
Out-of-pocket payments	15.1%
State & Local Government	10.5%
Other private funds	4.4%

1. What is the source of most payments for health care bills?
2. What belief is supported by this source of payments?
3. How would this pie chart change if health care is viewed as a right? Why?

**Debate Prep**

**DEBATE PREP:** Write down the statement you are given and your position. Use the space below to begin developing of your argument. You will have one minute to deliver your argument to the class and then we will vote.

**Debate topics:**

1. Jakob breaks his leg and requires a cast.
2. Darla is due to receive her Polio vaccine.

**NEW INFO:** Ask students, “Why does America have the most expensive health care? Why is the actual cost of health services kept from patients upfront?”

**THINK:** This debate activity could be done in several way. Here are two options: 1) Assign 3 students to each statement; each should be assigned to represent, prep, & argue one of the three viewpoints. 2) Assign one (or two) student(s) to each statement and allow them to determine their position and apply it to the scenario.



## Lesson 11.2 Instructor Guide

## MODULE 11: HEALTH POLICY

3. Isalah wants to be considered "cool" by his friends who pressure him to drink heavily. Years later he develops cirrhosis of the liver and needs to be hospitalized to stabilize his condition.
4. Michael would like to enroll in a program to help him treat his alcoholism.
5. Daria has her yearly mammogram and discovers she has breast cancer. The doctors recommend a mastectomy along with chemotherapy.
6. Susan would like reconstructive surgery after her mastectomy.
7. Sharon has had difficulty getting pregnant and would like to try in vitro fertilization to help her conceive.
8. Sharon is pregnant and would like to receive pre-natal care and counseling.
9. Sharon would like to have her child at home with a midwife.
10. Viridiana, who has smoked for twenty years, has lung cancer. The doctors recommend surgery and chemotherapy.
11. Silvestre becomes morbidly obese. He would like to receive gastric bypass surgery to help him lose weight.
12. Jenny is depressed and is on several antidepressants. She would like to see a psychiatrist to help her with her depression.
13. Jordan has diabetes and requires daily insulin monitoring. He needs an insulin pump and other equipment.
14. Ms. Smith falls down a flight of stairs in the morning at UICCP because she is running late and being careless. No one is there to help her so she tries to move and permanently damages her left hand. She now needs extremely expensive surgery that can only offer a 1/1000 chance of her recovering ability in that hand.
15. Mr. Jordan is taking the Scholastic bowl team on a trip and buys them all lunch. However, to save a few dollars he demands the cook use old ingredients, therefore they all fall ill with food poisoning. Many of the students require hospitalization for the sickness.
16. Mr. Marquez reads a yoga book published by a governmental agency in 1980. He incorporates a dangerous yoga position into his class that ends up causing severe nerve damage for several of his students. The move was removed from the same publication in 2004 because it was considered unsafe for teenagers.

My statement:

My position:

My argument:



## Lesson 11.2 Instructor Guide

## MODULE 11: HEALTH POLICY



### Right, Privilege or Responsibility?

**ALL:** Determine if the following statements represent that health care is a right, privilege or responsibility. Explain.

1. Under the Affordable Care Act, all new private plans will provide basic preventive services -- things like childhood immunizations and checkups, mammograms, colonoscopies, cervical screenings, and treatment for high blood pressure -- absolutely free of charge. No copay. No deductible. No co-insurance needed.
2. In the poor world, patients can sometimes scratch together enough money to pay a doctor bill; otherwise, they pay in potatoes or goat's milk or child care or whatever else they may have to give. If they have nothing, they don't get medical care.
3. Lower premiums are given to people who are not smokers.
4. How do you think the health of Americans would be different if health care was traditionally considered a right in the United States?



### Jose's Case

Jose was trying a new and difficult skateboarding trick when he fell and broke his arm. His parents both have jobs, but don't make a lot of money. He'll need an expensive x-ray, a cast, and several follow-up doctor visits.

Provide a 2-3 sentence argument explaining how his medical expenses should be paid for aligned to each of the following viewpoints:

Health care is a right:

Health care is a privilege:

Health care is a responsibility:

### ASSESS ANSWERS:

1. **RIGHT:** The Act recognizes that people should not be denied preventative services if they cannot pay; therefore, they have made them free.
2. **PRIVILEGE:** Only people who can pay for healthcare are able to receive healthcare.
3. **RESPONSIBILITY:** Incentives are given to people who take care of themselves demonstrating that people can control their health and should take care of themselves.

**HOMEWORK:** The purpose of this homework assignment is to give students an additional scenario to consider, after having heard a variety of viewpoints during the in-class debates, and one final chance to synthesize the leading arguments for each position in an example scenario.